

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084163 4

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

SEPTEMBER 1979



The materials produced herein are
intended for the sole use of law
students at McGill and Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

SEPTEMBER 1979

VOLUME I



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

TABLE OF CONTENTS

GENERAL

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION | 2 |
| I The Constitutional Framework | 2 |
| II The Legislative Framework | 2 |
| III The Institutional Framework | 2 |
| A. The Courts | 2 |
| B. Other Agencies | 2 |
| C. The Lawyer | 2 |
| IV Some Views on Marriage | 13 |
| CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT | 30 |
| I Introduction | 30 |
| II The Constitutional Issue | 31 |
| III The Statutory Conditions | 35 |
| A. License and Formalities | 35 |
| B. Effect of Failure to Comply with Statutory Conditions | 38 |
| C. Age and Parental Consent | 45 |
| IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law | 49 |
| A. Introduction | 49 |
| B. A Man and a Woman | 49 |
| C. ... Who are Free to Marry | 57 |
| D. ... Who Consent to Marry Each Other | 59 |
| E. ... And Who Are Able to Consummate the Marriage ... | 85 |
| V Defences To A Nullity Action | 97 |
| A. Knowledge | 97 |
| B. Conduct | 102 |
| C. Delay and Improper Motive | 110 |
| D. The Effect of Petitioner's Own Impotence | 115 |
| VI The Nullity Decree | 119 |
| A. Jurisdiction And Other Matters | 119 |
| B. Conflicts Problems | 120 |
| C. Economic Consequences | 120 |
| D. Children | 120 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| VII Reform: The English Approach | 121 |
| CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE | 129 |
| I Grounds | 129 |
| A. General | 129 |
| B. Immediate Relief: The Fault Grounds | 131 |
| C. Delayed Relief: Marital Breakdown | 199 |
| D. Proposals For Reform | 244 |
| II Bars and Defences | 249 |
| A. The Possibility of Reconciliation | 249 |
| B. Absolute Bars Applicable To All Grounds | 255 |
| C. Discretionary Bars | 266 |
| D. Special Bars Applicable Only To s. 4 Grounds | 312 |
| E. The Problem Of Insanity | 317 |
| III Nature And Consequences Of Divorce | 319 |
| A. Jurisdiction | 319 |
| B. Recognition | 324 |
| C. Consequences | 330 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES" | 332 |
| I Introduction | 332 |
| II Ownership Of Property | 333c |
| A. Introduction | 333c |
| B. The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act | 349 |
| C. The F.L.R. Act | 386 |
| III Mutual Duty of Maintenance | 410 |
| A. While Married | 410 |
| B. On Dissolution of Marriage | 422 |
| C. Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare and Problems of Federalism | 485 |
| CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN | 502 |
| I Introduction | 502 |
| II Proving And Disproving Parenthood | 504 |

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| III | Custody | 510 |
| | A. Private Disputes | 510 |
| | B. Disputes Involving The State Or A Coercive Agency.. | 635 |
| | C. Custody And Guardianship After Death Of Natural Guardian | 690 |
| IV | Access | 692 |
| V | Adoption | 698 |
| | A. The Statutory Scheme | 698 |
| | B. Consent Of Natural Parents | 705 |
| | C. The Religious Factor | 716 |
| | D. Access | 721 |
| VI | The Parent-Child Relationship | 723 |
| | A. Parental Control | 723 |
| | B. Economic Relations | 728 |
| CHAPTER SIX: PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AGAINST INTER- FERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES | | 754 |
| I | Between Husband And Wife | 754 |
| | A. Intentional Interference | 754 |
| II | Between Parent And Child | 770 |

APPENDIX OF STATUTES

VOLUME ITABLE OF CONTENTS

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION | 2 |
| I The Constitutional Framework | 2 |
| II The Legislative Framework | 2 |
| III The Institutional Framework | 2 |
| A. The courts | 2 |
| B. Other agencies | 2 |
| C. The lawyer | 2 |
| Reisman, Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty | 3 |
| Freeman and Freeman, Lawyers Cannot Avoid Counselling | 6 |
| IV Some Views on Marriage | 13 |
| Rudikoff, Marriage and Household | 13 |
| Sage, Dissolution of the Family under Swedish Law | 21 |
| Ryan, Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage | 26 |
| CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT | 30 |
| I Introduction | 30 |
| II The Constitutional Issue | 31 |
| Kerr | 31 |
| III The Statutory Conditions | 35 |
| A. License and formalities | 35 |
| The Marriage Act, 1977 | 35 |
| B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions .. | 38 |
| The Marriage Act, 1977 | 38 |
| Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario" | 38 |
| ✓ Alspector | 42 |
| Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario" | 43 |
| C. Age and parental consent | 45 |
| The Marriage Act, 1977 | 45 |
| Re Fox | 47 |
| IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law | 49 |
| A. Introduction | 49 |
| B. A man and a woman | 49 |
| Baker v. Nelson | 49 |
| North v. Matheson | 51 |
| M.T. v. J.T. | 54 |
| C. ... Who are free to marry | 57 |
| ⚡ Re Perry | 57 |
| The Marriage Act, 1977 | 58 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| D. ... who consent to marry each other ... | 59 |
| (1) Mental capacity | 59 |
| The Marriage Act, 1977 | 59 |
| Chertkow v. Feinstein | 60 |
| Whitaker v. McNeilly | 67 |
| (2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony | 70 |
| Nane v. Sykiotis | 70 |
| (3) Mental reservations | 73 |
| Gardner | 73 |
| (4) Duress | 75 |
| Thompson | 75 |
| (5) Fraud | 80 |
| Moss | 80 |
| H. v. C. | 83 |
| E. ... and who are able to consummate the marriage | 85 |
| (1) What constitutes consummation | 85 |
| Baxter | 85 |
| Wilkinson | 88 |
| (2) Inability to consummate | 90 |
| (a) Physical | 90 |
| Foster | 90 |
| (b) "Invincible repugnance" | 92 |
| Heil | 92 |
| Greenlees | 94 |
| Foisy | 95 |
| V Defences To A Nullity Action | 97 |
| A. Knowledge | 97 |
| G. v. G. | 97 |
| B. v. B. | 101 |
| B. Conduct | 102 |
| R.E.L. | 102 |
| W. v. W. | 107 |
| C. Delay and improper motive | 110 |
| Clifford | 110 |
| J. v. J. | 114 |
| D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence | 115 |
| Pettit | 115 |
| VI The Nullity Decree | 119 |
| A. Jurisdiction and other matters | 119 |
| The Annulment of Marriages Act | 119 |
| Rose | 119 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| B. Conflicts problems | 120 |
| C. Economic consequences | 120 |
| D. Children | 120 |
| VII Reform: The English Approach | 121 |
| Gretney, "The Nullity of Marriage Act 1971" | 121 |
| CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE | 129 |
| I Grounds | 129 |
| A. General | 129 |
| Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968" | 129 |
| Divorce Act | 130 |
| B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds | 131 |
| (1) Adultery | 131 |
| (a) What it is | 131 |
| Orford | 131 |
| Dennis | 133 |
| (b) Proving adultery | 134 |
| (i) Standard of proof | 134 |
| Smith | 134 |
| (ii) Methods | 134 |
| 1. Physical condition | 134 |
| M. v. M. | 134 |
| Preston-Jones | 136 |
| Himmelman | 138 |
| 2. Circumstances | 140 |
| Downie | 140 |
| Little | 143 |
| 3. Admissions | 147 |
| Divorce Act | 147 |
| The Evidence Act | 147 |
| Ewasiuk | 148 |
| Veysey | 149 |
| Rosen, "The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination as to Adultery - Should It Be Abolished?" | 150 |
| Rayner | 152 |
| Hunter | 152 |
| 4. Other decrees | 153 |
| Love | 153 |
| Meshwa | 155 |
| (2) Other sexual misconduct | 157 |
| Divorce Act | 157 |
| G. v. G. | 158 |
| M. v. M. | 160 |
| T. v. T. and W. | 161 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| (3) Cruelty | 163 |
| Divorce Act | 164 |
| (a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard ... | 164 |
| N. v. N. | 164 |
| (b) Grave and weighty conduct | 169 |
| ✓ Knoll | 169 |
| Feldman | 169 |
| Wittstock | 171 |
| Shumila | 175 |
| ✓ Hattie | 178 |
| (c) The relevance of intention | 179 |
| ✓ Gollins | 179 |
| ✓ Anderson | 193 |
| (d) Mutual cruelty | 196 |
| Kelly | 196 |
| (e) The time problem | 198 |
| C. Delayed relief: marital breakdown | 199 |
| Divorce Act | 199 |
| (1) "Separate and apart" | 201 |
| J.B. v. A.W.B. | 201 |
| Deslippe | 205 |
| Boechler | 206 |
| Dorchester | 208 |
| ✓ Lachman | 209 |
| (2) Desertion | 213 |
| (a) Without just cause | 213 |
| Nutley | 213 |
| Sullivan | 215 |
| ✓ Struk | 218 |
| ✓ G. v. G. | 219 |
| ✓ Bird | 222 |
| Marsden | 224 |
| Slon | 226 |
| (b) "...and with the intention to remain apart permanently ..." | 228 |
| Lilley | 228 |
| Kaczmarz | 232 |
| (c) the problem of mutual desertion | 235 |
| Price | 235 |
| (d) termination of desertion | 238 |
| Digiacinto | 238 |
| ✓ Richards | 239 |
| March | 241 |
| Gushta | 242 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| D. Proposals for reform | 244 |
| Goldstein & Gitter, On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce | 244 |
| II Bars and Defences | 249 |
| A. The possibility of reconciliation | 249 |
| Divorce Act | 249 |
| Irving & Irving, Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation | 250 |
| B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds | 255 |
| (1) Collusion | 255 |
| Divorce Act | 255 |
| Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined".. | 256 |
| (2) Fraud | 263 |
| Fromovitz | 263 |
| C. Discretionary bars | 266 |
| (1) Connivance | 266 |
| Divorce Act | 266 |
| Berger | 267 |
| (a) Consent | 268 |
| Rumbelow | 268 |
| T. v. T. | 270 |
| (b) Passive acquiescence: investigation | 272 |
| Pearl | 272 |
| Hechter | 273 |
| (c) Termination of connivance | 278 |
| Godfrey | 278 |
| (2) Condonation | 280 |
| (a) Introduction | 280 |
| Divorce Act | 281 |
| (b) The common law | 282 |
| (i) Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement.. | 282 |
| Leaderhouse | 282 |
| Douglas | 287 |
| Bateman v. Bateman | 288 |
| Vance | 289 |
| Henderson | 294 |
| (c) The effect of the Divorce Act | 297 |
| Divorce Act | 297 |
| Cherinski | 297 |
| Boivert v. Marineau | 298 |
| Armstrong | 301 |
| Blackburn | 303 |
| Brown | 304 |
| Blue | 308 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| (3) The exercise of discretion | 309 |
| Divorce Act | 309 |
| Blunt | 310 |
| D. Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds | 312 |
| Divorce Act | 312 |
| Raggett | 313 |
| Savage | 315 |
| E. The problem of insanity | 317 |
| B. v. B. | 317 |
| III Nature and Consequences of Divorce | 319 |
| A. Jurisdiction | 319 |
| Divorce Act | 319 |
| Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968 | 320 |
| B. Recognition | 324 |
| Divorce Act | 324 |
| Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968 | 324 |
| C. Consequences | 330 |
| (1) Status | 330 |
| Divorce Act | 330 |
| (2) Economic: see Chapter Four | 331 |
| (3) Children: see Chapter Five | 331 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES" | 332 |
| I. Introduction | 332 |
| Zuijdwijk, A Note on the Standard Matrimonial Property Regime in Quebec | 333 |
| II Ownership of Property | 333c |
| A. Introduction | 333c |
| Friedman, A Comparative Analysis | 333c |
| Law Reform Commission of Canada | 339 |
| B. The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act | 349 |
| Gissing | 349 |
| Murdoch | 359 |
| Rathwell | 368 |
| Becker v. Pettkus | 378 |
| Marvin | 382 |
| C. The F.L.R. Act | 386 |
| (1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership of all types of assets | 386 |

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| (2) Provisions concerning family assets | 388 |
| (a) What is a family asset | 388 |
| (b) Powers of court in relation to family assets and other types of property | 390 |
| (3) Provisions relating to the matrimonial home | 392 |
| (a) What is the matrimonial home | 392 |
| (b) Consequences of finding that property is a matrimonial home | 393 |
| Silverstein | 395 |